

MAGICTHEGATHERING.COM

ARTICLES
 ↓ Related links
 ➔ Read other articles

TOURNAMENTS

MAGIC ONLINE

Article Search ▾ ➔

Extended Week and PT Columbus Musings



John Carter · Saturday School
Saturday, November 6, 2004

Send your rules questions to **Magic** Rules Manager [John Carter](#). Can't find the answer to your question somewhere else, like the [Magic Comprehensive Rules](#)? Maybe he's already answered it! Try the [Saturday School Searchable Rules Database](#).

I'm fresh off the plane from [PT Columbus](#), and I keep asking myself, what just happened to Extended? For the first time in Pro Tour history we have a Top 8 consisting of [8 different decks](#). If you love rock-paper-scissors, Columbus was not the place to be, but if you love playing **Magic** with or against everything but the kitchen sink, then there was no better place to be last weekend. Yes, Affinity won, but it was also otherwise shut out of the Top 8. As for the upcoming Extended PTQ season, your guess is as good as mine, but you can bet I'll be there to see what's what. For now, it's on to All Extended Week!

Q: What happens if an enchantment such as **Arrest** is on a creature, and you use **Glory's** ability from the graveyard to give that creature protection from white? -- Eric

A: The **Arrest** is put into the graveyard as a state-based effect [CR 420.5d]. Protection from white includes the stipulation that it cannot have white enchantments on it.

Q: Will **Zephid's Embrace** remove previous enchantments on the creature? --Caroline

A: No, it makes the enchanted creature untargetable, but enchantments already on it are no longer targeting the creature like they were when they were played.

Q: If I had an ability that cost blue and one colorless would **Heartstone** make it cost blue? --Darkonus

A: Yes. The "total cost" math is "mana cost" + additions - reductions. 1 + nothing - 1 = 1



Q: I have a **Palinchron** in play and my opponent attacks with a **Molimo, Maro-Sorcerer** that's an 8/8. I block the Molimo with the **Palinchron** and return it to my hand. Do I get 3, 8 or 0 damage? -Stian J.

A: You take 3 or 8, depending on when you return the **Palinchron** to your hand. Assuming that you'd rather take 3, wait for combat damage to be put on the stack (3 points to you, and 5 to the

Palinchron) and then use **Palinchron's** ability. The damage will be dealt based on the original assignment: 3 to you, and none to the missing **Palinchron** [CR 310.4c].

Q: I have a 2/2 **Frogmite** that I have equipped with a **Cranial Plating** (making it get +8/+0). I declare it as attacking, then my friend plays **Humble** on it, turning it into a 0/1... We couldn't figure out whether it then becomes an 8/1 due to the plating or not. --Joshua J

A: It's a 0/1. To figure out any creature's power and toughness, start with the base P/T. Then apply characteristic-setting abilities (there are none in this case). Then you apply counters [CR 418.5a and Glossary: Counter]. Then you apply the P/T modifiers in timestamp order [CR 418.5a]. For **Frogmite**, we get 2/2 then no CSA, then no counters, and then **Plating** timestamped first followed by **Humble**. So it's 2/2 with (+8/+0) = 10/2 then **Humble** = 0/1.

* **Extra*** Whenever the **Plating** becomes attached to a new creature, it gets a new timestamp [CR 418.5e]. So if you move it twice-- once to attach it to a different creature, and again to attach it back to the **Frogmite** -- you'd apply same-old-timestamped **Humble** then newly-timestamped **Plating** and get an 8/1.

Q: I have a **Phantom Nishoba** in play with a **Mirari's Wake**. My opponent has a **Suntail Hawk**. When I attack with the Nishoba, he plays **Humble**, which turns my Nishoba into a 0/1, and then he blocks with his Hawk. My opponent says **Humble** makes my Nishoba a 0/1, and that **Wake** won't make it a 1/2. Is he right?

Assuming my opponent is right, would the Nishoba still live because of its "prevent all damage" ability or would **Humble** negate this advantage because of its an ability? --Nick M.

A: Your Nishoba is dead and stays that way. The base P/T is 0/0. Add the counters to get 7/7. Then adjust P/T in timestamp order: 7/7 to 8/8 from **Wake** and down to 0/1 from **Humble**. As for the prevention part, it is an ability, so **Humble** removes it.

Q: I use **Kiku, Night's Flower's** ability on a **Wild Mongrel** and my friend says that the Mongrel doesn't die because the damage to resolve... then discards a card so he says the Mongrel lives... why is that? --Tom K.

A: Your friend is mistaken, and his Mongrel is dead. When **Kiku's** ability resolves, the targeted creature damages itself based on its power right then. No one has priority to even activate the **Mongrel** much less wait for the activation to resolve. The **Mongrel** will be destroyed when state-based effects check after **Kiku's** ability resolves.

Q: If I play an **Isochron Scepter** and imprint it with the **Night/Day** would I be able to activate the Scepter for Day ability even though it costs 3? --Dayan

A: Yes, **Night/Day** imprint fine (since **Night** is less than 2), and you can play the **Day** half just as well. You pick the half you play when you announce the spell [CR Glossary: Split], and the **Scepter** doesn't evaluate the converted cost at that time—it just covers the cost for you.

Q: If I paid 8 to play the **Chalice** with 4 counters on it and then played **Rush of Knowledge**, how many cards do I draw if the **Chalice** is my only permanent? --Brad C.

A: You draw 0. X is defined [CR Glossary "X"] is being equal to 0 anywhere but on the stack. On the stack, X is the value chosen by the player while announcing the spell [CR 409.1b]. The converted mana cost of the card and permanent **Chalice** is {0} + {0}. The converted mana cost of the spell **Chalice** is {stated valued} + {stated value again}.

Q: **Mistform Ultimus** + **Konda's Banner** makes the **Ultimus** a really big creature, because he shares every creature type with himself, and he is every creature type in **Magic**. Plus he gets



+1/+1 for being blue. And everything else you control gets +1/+1 for every creature type it has, and another if its blue. Or maybe not? --Hank S.

A: Take the “not” option. **Konda's Banner** asks two questions:

- 1) Does a creature share a color with the creature I'm equipping?
- 2) Does a creature share a creature type with the creature I'm equipping?

How many colors and or creature types doesn't matter for either question. In the case of **Mistform Ultimus**, the answers are 1) “yes” and 2) “yes”. So he'll get +1/+1 twice.

Extra While **Mistform Ultimus** might have every creature type, that doesn't mean he gives every creature a type-related bonus. After all, poor **Gerrard Capashen** is still unemployed (he has no creature type since “Legends” turned “Legendary”).

Q: Can **Threaten** target untapped creatures? I think it can, but whenever I play it that way, I get objections from my opponent. –Matt

A: You can **Threaten** tapped or untapped creatures. The wording on **Threaten** reads, “target creature”. The fact **Threaten** untaps the creature means nothing as far as what you can or can't target.

Q: I target my **Mogg Fanatic** with **Seething Anger** and pay the buyback cost. My opponent removes the Goblin from the game in response. Does **Seething Anger** go back to my hand? – HolgiR

A: No, it's countered for lack of target [CR 413.2a]. When a spell with buyback is countered, the whole thing is countered—including the buyback part.

Q: If I play **Rancor** on a creature while **Cowardice** is in play, when the creature is returned to its owner's hand, do I get my **Rancor** back? --Ben Frost

A: No, you won't. Playing **Rancor** requires you to target the creature. This triggers **Cowardice**. That trigger goes on the stack on top of the **Rancor**. The trigger resolves, and the targeted creature bounces. When **Rancor** tries to resolve, the game realizes that the target is gone, and the **Rancor** is countered [CR 413.2a].

Q: If I use **Sneak Attack** to bring a creature in play during my "end of turn"-phase, do I need to sacrifice it? –Tume

A: No right away, but you will during the next *end of turn step*. Putting a creature into play with **Sneak Attack** sets up a delayed triggered ability [CR 404.4]. When the “at end of turn” event occurs next, you'll be required to sacrifice the creature [CR 404.4b].

Extra As we covered in similar cases before, playing **Time Stop** before the trigger occurs doesn't help—it'll still be waiting for the event. But if you **Time Stop** after the trigger goes on the stack and before the trigger resolves, you'll have used up the trigger and saved the doomed creature from the resolution of the trigger. **Stifle** can use up the trigger in the same way.



Q: When using cards like **Arc Lightning**, can you target more than 3 creatures and do 0 damage to some of them if you wish to activate the ability of **Horobi, Death's Wail**? –Alfred

A: No, you must divide damage up so at least one point goes to each target [CR 409.1e].

Q: I have a **Sacred Ground** in play and a land with **Wild Growth** on it. If my opponent plays land destruction on the land would I lose my enchantment? I think I do but I wanted to make sure and couldn't find a ruling in the Saturday School archives. -David H.

A: You'll get your land back, but you'll lose the enchantment. What happens is this:
1) The land is destroyed and goes to your graveyard, triggering **Sacred Ground**.
2) State-based effects put enchanted land into the graveyard on top of the dead land.
3) Triggered ability goes on the stack. (Let's assume players both pass.)
4) Resolving trigger puts the land back into play without anything attached to it.
Thanks for checking the [archives](#); sorry I don't have better news.

Q: What is my hand size if I have **Spellbook** and **Recycle** in play at the same time? --Liam S.

A: The answer depends on timestamp order. Timestamp is basically the order in which things entered a zone (with three exceptions [CR 418.5e]). Here's what we get with **Spellbook** and **Recycle**:
Spellbook and then **Recycle**: No maximum and then 2 = 2.
Recycle and then **Spellbook**: 2 and then no maximum = no maximum.

Q: My friend attacked me with a **Moss Kami** and I have **Defensive Formation** out. I block with two 1/1 creatures. Can I then choose not to pass the damage onto the next creature? Can I choose not to deal trample damage to myself? --AW

A: Yes, and yes, you assign all the damage where you want it to go. Trample doesn't require you to spread damage to creatures or players if there's any blockers, so you can assign all the damage to the soon-to-be-very-dead 1/1.

Q: If I have a **Kiki-Jiki**, **Mirror Breaker** in play and I make a copy of a **Goblin Marshal**. Would it bring two 1/1 red goblin creatures into play? If so, at the end of turn would that token copy of the Marshal then hit the graveyard causing another two goblins to come into play? Also would this combo also work with the abilities of **Siege-Gang Commander**? --Kent

A: Your Kiki-Jiki'd Marshal would make goblins when it came into play and when it went to the graveyard. Putting a copy of **Siege-Gang Commander** into play would make tokens in the same way; and yes, they would benefit from things like **Goblin King** and be sacrificable for **Siege-Gang Commander**.

Q: My opponent's **Faceless Butcher** comes into play, removing my **Chainer**, **Dementia Master**. By removing Chainer, the Butcher is removed. Because the Butcher leaves play, I say Chainer comes back. My opponent disagrees. Please help. --Bill

A: You get the Master back. Here's how:
1) Butcher comes into play and removes Chainer, triggering Chainer (since he left play)
2) Chainer's leaves-play trigger removes the Butcher, triggering the Butcher
3) The Butcher's leaves-play trigger resolves and returns Chainer
Simply put, Nightmares should not mess with the Master.

Q: The non-active player controls **Akroma, Angel of Wrath**. The active player plays **Exhume**. Both players put a **Gilded Drake** into play from the **Exhume**. The active player targets the opponent's Angel, and the other targets the opponent's Drake. What happens? --Miyaken

A: As you hinted at, both triggers stack (active player, non-active player). Now we begin resolving the stack, but first let's review **Gilded Drake**'s wording:

Flying

When Gilded Drake comes into play, choose one — sacrifice Gilded Drake; or exchange control of Gilded Drake and target creature an opponent controls. If you can't make the exchange, sacrifice Gilded Drake. This ability can't be countered.
(*This effect doesn't end at end of turn.*)



So the non-active player (NAP) will follow the instructions and exchange control by trading one Drake for the other. So we have both Drakes switch sides. When the AP tries to exchange the Drake for the Angel, two things happen: first, we realize that both the Drake to be exchanged and the Angel are controlled by the same player and therefore can't be exchanged [CR Glossary: Exchange], and second, we realize that since his Drake is now controlled by another player, he can't sacrifice it either [CR Glossary: Sacrifice]. Short Version: Akroma watches while the Drakes switch sides... nothing more.

Q: I was reading the coverage for [PT Columbus](#) and I saw that Pierre Canali [used Meddling Mage via Aether Vial to effectively counter Circular Logic](#). In the article it said that this worked because [Circular Logic](#) was still in the madness zone. I was wondering if [Meddling Mage](#) could be used to "counter" other spells than those using Madness. --Josh

A: No, [Meddling Mage](#) isn't so useful against non-Madness spells. The key is that in order to play the Madness spell, you have to wait until the Madness trigger resolves. This window of opportunity exists because of the way Madness works, and it's that window that let Pierre sneak the Mage into play in time to effectively meddle.

Q: While playing with some of my friends I had a [Myr Landshaper](#) change one of my opponents' Swamps into an artifact. Then I used [Splinter](#) on it. And since it says remove all instances of the card from library I assumed that the game was over since my friend was playing mono black. But my friend said that that combo was voided my MTG. --Chris B.

A: The combo works, but the game's not over yet. Your opponent will still have the other Swamps he or she had in play at the time, and the library could still contain non-Swamp lands (like [Vault of Whispers](#)). True, the opponent might not be in good shape, but they might pull off a comeback anyway. As for voiding combos, the people that make those decisions don't void "combos", they ban cards, and [Splinter](#) and [Myr Landshaper](#) are both far far far away from being banned (trust me... very far).



Q: I am wondering if all versions of [Dark Ritual](#), both the instant and the mana source, are banned in tournament play. --Gaabriel T.

A: [Dark Ritual](#) is banned in Extended. It's legal in several other formats (you can just check the autocard window or [Gatherer](#), but remember that the official source is always the [Magic: The Gathering Floor Rules](#)). It does not matter if the card you're asking about was printed as an Interrupt, Mana Source, or Instant.

I do have one little story to share from PT Columbus that is much too amusing to pass up. Ryuichi Arita is playing at table #1 in round three. I am patrolling the floor when I see Ryuichi with Plains, [Brushland](#), and [Starlit Sanctum](#) as his only lands. He has a [Daru Spiritualist](#) in play and nothing else. Sensing strangeness, I stop to watch. No sooner do I stop by than the following happens:

The Plains pays for a [Nomads en-Kor](#). Ryuichi vigorously pokes the Spiritualist over and over again and says with his Japanese accent, "Million! Millions!" He pauses all of the sudden and taps the [Brushland](#) for white. Holding up a solitary finger he announces with emphasis, "One." The Spiritualist is promptly sacrificed to the Sanctum while Ryuichi chants, "Millions, millions, millions!" His opponent quietly offers his hand in defeat.

It says a lot to me—a long time Pro Tour judge-- to see a player enjoying himself so openly even at the highest levels of play. The fact he was being so polite with opponents and made \$7,500 while doing it is just icing on the Extended cake. Best of luck to all you players out there when you decide to grab a slice.

Class dismissed.

--Carter

The guys here in R&D go to States each year, and we're interested in hearing more from you about the event. Over the next weeks I'll be asking a series of questions to help us understand what's on your mind.

If you went to the event, how did you find out about your State (Province, Island, Territory) Champs?

- Friends
- Local store
- Tournament organizer who runs PTQs, etc.
- At the prerelease
- Magicthegathering.com's front page
- Magicthegathering.com's tournament center
- Saturday School very late that Friday

Submit my Vote



[Discuss](#) on the message boards



[Respond](#) via email



[John Carter](#) archive

[WHAT'S NEW](#) [CORPORATE INFO](#) [WHERE TO BUY](#) [INTERNATIONAL](#) [SUPPORT](#) [SITEMAP](#) [PRODUCTS](#)

© 1995-2005 Wizards of the Coast, Inc., a subsidiary of Hasbro, Inc. All Rights Reserved.
Wizards is headquartered in Renton, Washington, PO Box 707, Renton, WA 98057.
[PRIVACY STATEMENT](#)